

Looking towards a Church *fully reconciled*

The Final Report of the Anglican–Roman Catholic
International Commission 1983–2005 (ARCIC II)

Edited by Adelbert Denaux,
Nicholas Sagovsky &
Charles Sherlock

SPCK

First published in Great Britain in 2016

Society for Promoting Christian Knowledge
36 Causton Street
London SW1P 4ST
www.spckpublishing.co.uk

© Copyright 2016 by the Secretary General of the Anglican Communion and the Pontifical Council for Promoting Christian Unity.

Unless otherwise indicated, the Scripture quotations contained herein are from the New Revised Standard Version of the Bible, Anglicized Edition, copyright © 1989, 1995 by the Division of Christian Education of the National Council of the Churches, in the United States of America, and are used by permission. All rights reserved. Set in: 11/13.5pt, Minion.

All rights reserved. No part of this book may be reproduced or transmitted in any form or by any means, electronic or mechanical, including photocopying, recording, or by any information storage and retrieval system, without permission in writing from the publisher.

SPCK does not necessarily endorse the individual views contained in its publications.

British Library Cataloguing-in-Publication Data

A catalogue record for this book is available from the British Library

ISBN 978-028-107-779-3
eBook ISBN 978-028-107-765-6

Typeset by Graphicraft Ltd, Hong Kong
First printed in Great Britain by Ashford Colour Press
Subsequently digitally printed in Great Britain

Produced on paper from sustainable forests

Contents

Preface	v
The Status of this Volume	vii
Abbreviations	viii
Introduction	ix

PART A THE AGREED STATEMENTS OF ARCIC II

1 Salvation and the Church (1987)	3
2 Church as Communion (1991)	35
3 Life in Christ: Morals, Communion and the Church (1994)	70
4 The Gift of Authority: Authority in the Church III (1999)	123
5 Mary: Grace and Hope in Christ (2005)	175
6 From ARCIC II to ARCIC III: Pointers for Further Work	242

PART B THE SCOPE AND METHOD OF ARCIC II'S WORK

7 The Use of Scripture in the Agreed Statements of ARCIC	249
8 The Doctrinal Methods of ARCIC II	257
9 Theological Themes in the Agreed Statements of ARCIC II	266
10 The <i>Koinonia</i> Ecclesiology of ARCIC I and II	277

PART C THE ARCIC II STORY

11 A New Commission: First Agreed Statement	289
12 <i>Koinonia</i> Articulated: Second Agreed Statement	297
13 A Reformed Commission: Third Agreed Statement	305
14 From 1896 to 1998: Fourth Agreed Statement	310
15 Widening the Dialogue: IARCCUM, Fifth Agreed Statement	319
Appendix A: ARCIC II Participants	329
Appendix B: Common Declarations by the Pope and the Archbishop of Canterbury	334

Preface

By the Co-Chairs of ARCIC III

Looking towards a Church Fully Reconciled provides an accessible source for the five Agreed Statements of ARCIC II. It offers critical analyses of their contexts and of responses made, and resources ‘to promote the reception of its previous work by presenting the previous work of ARCIC as a corpus’ (from the mandate of ARCIC III). In fulfilling this task, ARCIC III has come to appreciate more fully its wider mandate, to explore ‘the Church as Communion, local and universal, and how in communion the local and universal Church come to discern right ethical teaching’.

ARCIC I established a pattern of annual residential meetings for a week or more, with papers written in the interim, typically involving Sub-Commission meetings. This pattern continued with ARCIC II and III. At each meeting a daily eucharist is celebrated, Bible study is undertaken, and evening prayers are offered, alternating between the two traditions. The residential nature of the Commission’s meetings makes for a high degree of understanding and trust being built up: this facilitates honesty and frank exchanges, as between friends unafraid to face differences. Further, alliances and fault-lines often run across the Anglican–Roman Catholic boundary: a common bond exists between Scripture scholars, for example, while the joint pastoral insight of bishops on the Commission is significant.

The reality of our divisions since the Reformation remains a scandal, when we think of Christ’s call to us to be one (*Ut unum sint*, Jn 17.21). We believe, however, that the redeeming grace of God is never withdrawn and that the reconciling movement of the Holy Spirit abounds all the more in the midst of our schism and woundedness.

As Anglicans and Roman Catholics we are called to witness to this grace-filled movement by reaching out to each other across the divide, by seeking increasing degrees of communion, and by creating partnerships in mission where we can. When this happens, there is a clear and strong witness to the world, which is itself riven with division and enmity.

Active Christian reconciliation can become a sign of hope in and for the world. This witnesses to the possibility of healing and bridge building, of the action of divine love in the conflicted realities of human life. We therefore pray that the work of ARCIC may be inspired by the

Preface

Spirit of God and so become a means of grace and a living parable of hope.

Continuing the journey which began with ARCIC I and continued to unfold in the work of ARCIC II, this book therefore seeks to look forward, anticipating what it will mean to live in a fully reconciled Church. Its authors trust that such reflection on the ARCIC heritage will serve the mission of God through the reconciled people of God, walking ever more closely together.

+ David Moxon

+ Bernard Longley

Pentecost 2016

The Sisterhood of St John the Divine, Toronto

The Status of this Volume

The book published here is the work of the Anglican–Roman Catholic International Commission (ARCIC). The authorities who appointed the Commission have allowed it to be published so that the Agreed Statements may be widely discussed. It is not an authoritative declaration by the Roman Catholic Church or by the Anglican Communion, who will study and evaluate the Agreed Statements in due course.

Three types of material are included, in fulfilment of ARCIC III's mandate 'to promote the reception of [the Commission's] previous work by presenting the work of ARCIC as a corpus, with appropriate introduction':

- a. The five Agreed Statements issued by ARCIC II, presented in Part A. It is these which the Anglican Communion and the Roman Catholic Church are invited to receive.
- b. Introductions for each Statement, together with a collation of responses (official, ecclesial, and scholarly) thus far made. ARCIC III has analysed these with a view to 'promote their reception' and identify further work that needs to be undertaken. This supplementary material in Part A, supported by bibliographies, is now presented for publication by the members of ARCIC III in fulfilment of its mandate.
- c. Essays intended to support the reception of the work of ARCIC II 'as a corpus' (Parts B and C). The Commission asked the three members who had served on ARCIC II to prepare this material. Part B surveys theological themes which can be found throughout the corpus; Part C tells the ARCIC II story.

Abbreviations

ACC	Anglican Consultative Council
ARC Canada	Anglican–Roman Catholic Dialogue in Canada
ARCIC	Anglican–Roman Catholic International Commission
ARCUSA	Anglican–Roman Catholic Dialogue in the United States of America
AustARC	Australian Anglican–Roman Catholic Dialogue
CDF	Congregation for the Doctrine of the Faith
ECUSA	The Episcopal Church in the United States of America (now The Episcopal Church)
FOAG	Faith and Order Advisory Group of the Church of England
IARCCUM	International Anglican–Roman Catholic Commission on Unity and Mission
IASCER	Inter-Anglican Standing Commission on Ecumenical Relations
PCPCU	The Pontifical Council for Promoting Christian Unity (formerly SPCU)
SPCU	The Secretariat for Promoting Christian Unity (now PCPCU)
USCCB	United States Conference of Catholic Bishops
WCC	The World Council of Churches

Introduction

The Anglican–Roman Catholic International Commission (ARCIC) first met in January 1970. It was the outcome of the first official visit to Rome since the Reformation by an Archbishop of Canterbury. Pope Paul VI and Archbishop Michael Ramsey, in their Common Declaration of 24 March 1966, stated that they ‘intend to inaugurate between the Roman Catholic Church and the Anglican Communion a serious dialogue which, founded on the Gospels and on the ancient common traditions, may lead to that unity in truth, for which Christ prayed.’¹ The Report of a Joint Preparatory Commission (*The Malta Report*), endorsed by the 1968 Lambeth Conference and by the Vatican Secretariat (now Pontifical Council) for Promoting Christian Unity (PCPCU), led to ARCIC’s establishment a year later.

The Commission produced four Agreed Statements over twelve years of work: *Eucharistic Doctrine* (1971), *Ministry and Ordination* (1973), *Authority in the Church I and II* (1976, 1981), and *Elucidations on Eucharistic Doctrine* (1979) and *Elucidations on Ministry and Ordination* (1979). These were drawn together in *The Final Report*, issued in 1981, including an *Elucidation on Authority in the Church*. Official responses came from the Congregation for the Doctrine of the Faith (CDF) in 1982, the Lambeth Conference of 1988, and the Roman Catholic Church in 1991.²

ARCIC II was established in 1983, and continued until 2005. It was a particular fruit of the third Common Declaration, made in Canterbury on 29 May 1982 (the Eve of Pentecost) by Pope John Paul II and Archbishop Robert Runcie. Together they gave thanks to God for the work of the first ARCIC, and set out this mandate for ARCIC II:

The new International Commission is to continue the work already begun; to examine, especially in the light of our respective judgements on *The Final Report*, the outstanding doctrinal differences which still separate us, with a view to their eventual resolution; to study all that hinders the mutual recognition of the ministries of our Communion, and to recommend what

¹ The texts of all the Common Declarations can be found in Appendix B.

² The text of *The Final Report* was republished, together with the responses listed, official comments, and expert opinion, in Christopher Hill and Edward Yarnold SJ (eds.), *Anglicans and Roman Catholics: The Search for Unity* (London: SPCK and CTS, 1994). Fr Yarnold was a Roman Catholic member of ARCIC I; Hill (now Bishop Hill) was the Anglican Co-Secretary of ARCIC I and II from 1974 to 1989, and is a member of ARCIC III.

Introduction

practical steps will be necessary when, on the basis of our unity in faith, we are able to proceed to the restoration of full communion.

Archbishop Runcie and Pope John Paul II met again on 2 October 1989, and in a fourth Common Declaration committed the two traditions once more to ‘the arduous journey to Christian unity’, especially as represented in ARCIC’s work. The difficult nature of this journey is recognized in the fifth Common Declaration, made on 5 December 1996 by Pope John Paul II and Archbishop George Carey, which notes ‘the obstacle to reconciliation posed by the ordination of women’. Even so, this Declaration encouraged ARCIC II in its work, and led to a conference in 2000 at Mississauga, Toronto, of thirteen pairs of bishops from places across the globe where Anglican and Roman Catholic jurisdictions exist side by side. This conference led to the formation, a year later, of the International Anglican–Roman Catholic Commission on Unity and Mission (IARCCUM), whose aim is to facilitate the outcomes of ARCIC’s work at the local level.

In 2007 IARCCUM issued an Agreed Statement, *Growing Together in Unity and Mission: Building on 40 Years of Anglican–Roman Catholic Dialogue* (London: SPCK). Its first part synthesizes the work of ARCIC I and ARCIC II under seven headings:

Belief in God as Trinity;
Church as Communion in Mission;
The Living Word of God;
Baptism, Eucharist, Ministry;
Authority in the Church;
Discipleship and Holiness; and
the Blessed Virgin Mary.

The second part presents a series of practical proposals based upon this synthesis. The volume does not include ARCIC’s Agreed Statements, however. The mandate of ARCIC III thus included the following request from Pope Benedict XVI and the Archbishop of Canterbury, Rowan Williams:

We ask the Commission to promote the reception of its previous work by presenting the work of ARCIC as a corpus, with appropriate introduction.

To fulfil this request, ARCIC III established a working group of the three members who also served on ARCIC II—Adelbert Denaux, Nicholas Sagovsky, and Charles Sherlock—to have responsibility for this project. They have been assisted by other ARCIC III members in the task of gathering these Statements together, placing them in their context, assessing their reception, and setting out where further work needs to be undertaken. This volume represents the outcome of that task.

PART A
THE AGREED STATEMENTS
OF ARCIC II

Chapter 1

Salvation and the Church (1987)

Introducing the Statement

The Final Report brought to a close the first stage of ARCIC's work. The ecumenical optimism which accompanied its publication did not disguise, but rather amplified the recognition that more work needed to be done. In particular, significant numbers of Anglicans, not least from the evangelical tradition, argued that the agreements reached did not address the underlying theological issues on which the sixteenth-century breach of communion hinged. The 1981 Anglican Consultative Council meeting, noting the emerging agreement in Lutheran–Roman Catholic dialogue, thus requested that ARCIC take up 'justification by faith'. Conversely, several Roman Catholic responses asked for further exploration of the concept of Church as *koinonia* which undergirded *The Final Report*.

As noted earlier, ARCIC II was established as an outcome of the Third Common Declaration by the Archbishop of Canterbury (Robert Runcie) and Pope John Paul II.¹ The new Commission was mandated to explore remaining doctrinal differences, the mutual recognition of ministries, and practical steps towards unity. The new Commission's first meeting (1983) took as its theme 'The Church, Grace and Salvation': the doctrine of justification by faith was chosen as the focus of attention for a working group. The theme of the 1984 meeting was thus 'The Church, Salvation and the Doctrine of Justification'. Having reached agreement on the outline for a Statement, the drafting group prepared a text, 'The Church and Justification'. This would be the basis of the Agreed Statement, *Salvation and the Church*, adopted two years later.

In reading the text, it is important to appreciate that the inter-twining of ecclesiology and salvation around the presenting motif, 'justification by faith', was consciously intended from the beginning of ARCIC II's work. The choice of 'salvation' as the over-arching theme followed ARCIC's method of avoiding polemical language, and setting the dialogue in the

¹ For details of its meetings, see Part C below. Commission members are listed in Appendix A; the Common Declaration can be found in Appendix B3.

The Agreed Statements of ARCIC II

widest theological context. This theme is grounded in the name given by revelation to the Word incarnate, ‘Jesus’, meaning ‘saviour’ (Matthew 1.21, 25), and carries an ‘all-embracing meaning’ (§13). Further, ARCIC II situated its work in the context of ecclesiology in continuity with ARCIC I’s focus on *koinonia*.

As regards justification itself, close attention was paid to the detailed work undertaken between Lutherans and Roman Catholics, especially in the USA. ARCIC II recognised from the beginning of its discussion that divergences between Anglicans and Roman Catholics on this issue were much less than between Roman Catholics and Lutherans: rather, the differences were in how justification is lived out—a further reason for taking ‘salvation’ as the core issue.²

² The focus of Articles XI–XIV and the Homilies listed in Article XXX is less on whether ‘justification by faith only’ is right, but that it is ‘a most wholesome Doctrine, and very full of comfort’ (i.e. strengthening). The focus is in what sense ‘good works’ are necessary—not as contributing to justification in any way, but as its proper fruit.

SALVATION AND THE CHURCH

An Agreed Statement by the Anglican–Roman
Catholic International Commission (ARCIC II)

CONTENTS

The Status of the Document	8
Preface by the Co-Chairmen	9
Introduction	11
Salvation and Faith	14
Salvation and Justification	15
Salvation and Good Works	19
The Church and Salvation	21
Conclusion	24

THE STATUS OF THE DOCUMENT

The document published here is the work of the Second Anglican–Roman Catholic International Commission (ARCIC II). It is simply a joint statement of the Commission. The authorities who appointed the Commission have allowed the statement to be published so that it may be discussed and improved by the suggestions received. It is not an authoritative declaration by the Roman Catholic Church or by the Anglican Communion, who will evaluate the document in order to take a position on it in due time.

The Commission will be glad to receive observations and criticisms made in a constructive and fraternal spirit. Its work is done to serve the progress of the two communions towards unity. It will give responsible attention to every serious comment which is likely to help in improving or completing the result so far achieved. This wider collaboration will make its work to a greater degree work in common, and by God's grace 'will lead us to the full unity to which he calls us' (*Common Declaration of Pope John Paul II and the Archbishop of Canterbury, Pentecost 1982*).

PREFACE

By the Co-Chairmen

The 29th of May 1982, the Eve of the Feast of Pentecost, was a day of great significance for the Anglican and Roman Catholic Churches on their path towards unity. In the footsteps of St Augustine of Canterbury whom his predecessor Pope Gregory the Great had sent from Rome to convert the English, Pope John Paul II visited Canterbury. There, in the church founded by Augustine, he and the present Archbishop of Canterbury, Dr Robert Runcie, along with representatives of the English churches and of the whole Anglican Communion, proclaimed and celebrated the one baptismal faith which we all share. The Pope and the Archbishop also gave thanks to God for the work of the first Anglican–Roman Catholic International Commission (ARCIC I) whose *The Final Report* had just been published, and agreed to the establishment of a new commission (ARCIC II) to continue its work.

The primary task of ARCIC II is to examine and try to resolve those doctrinal differences which still divide us. Accordingly, at the request of the Anglican Consultative Council (Newcastle, September 1981), we have addressed ourselves to the doctrine of justification, which at the time of the Reformation was a particular cause of contention. This request sprang out of a widespread view that the subject of justification and salvation is so central to the Christian faith that, unless there is assurance of agreement on this issue, there can be no full doctrinal agreement on this issue, there can be no full doctrinal agreement between our two Churches.

We have spent more than three years on this task. The doctrine of justification raises issues of great complexity and profound mystery. Furthermore it can be properly treated only within the wider context of the doctrine of salvation as a whole. This in turn has involved discussion of the role of the Church in Christ's saving work. Hence the title of our agreed statement: *Salvation and the Church*. We do not claim to have composed a complete treatment of the doctrine of the Church. Our discussion is limited to its role in salvation.

In our work, particularly on the doctrine of justification as such, we have been greatly helped by the statement *Justification by Faith* agreed in 1983 by the Lutheran–Roman Catholic Consultation in the USA (Augsburg

Introduction

practical steps will be necessary when, on the basis of our unity in faith, we are able to proceed to the restoration of full communion.

Archbishop Runcie and Pope John Paul II met again on 2 October 1989, and in a fourth Common Declaration committed the two traditions once more to ‘the arduous journey to Christian unity’, especially as represented in ARCIC’s work. The difficult nature of this journey is recognized in the fifth Common Declaration, made on 5 December 1996 by Pope John Paul II and Archbishop George Carey, which notes ‘the obstacle to reconciliation posed by the ordination of women’. Even so, this Declaration encouraged ARCIC II in its work, and led to a conference in 2000 at Mississauga, Toronto, of thirteen pairs of bishops from places across the globe where Anglican and Roman Catholic jurisdictions exist side by side. This conference led to the formation, a year later, of the International Anglican–Roman Catholic Commission on Unity and Mission (IARCCUM), whose aim is to facilitate the outcomes of ARCIC’s work at the local level.

In 2007 IARCCUM issued an Agreed Statement, *Growing Together in Unity and Mission: Building on 40 Years of Anglican–Roman Catholic Dialogue* (London: SPCK). Its first part synthesizes the work of ARCIC I and ARCIC II under seven headings:

Belief in God as Trinity;
Church as Communion in Mission;
The Living Word of God;
Baptism, Eucharist, Ministry;
Authority in the Church;
Discipleship and Holiness; and
the Blessed Virgin Mary.

The second part presents a series of practical proposals based upon this synthesis. The volume does not include ARCIC’s Agreed Statements, however. The mandate of ARCIC III thus included the following request from Pope Benedict XVI and the Archbishop of Canterbury, Rowan Williams:

We ask the Commission to promote the reception of its previous work by presenting the work of ARCIC as a corpus, with appropriate introduction.

To fulfil this request, ARCIC III established a working group of the three members who also served on ARCIC II—Adelbert Denaux, Nicholas Sagovsky, and Charles Sherlock—to have responsibility for this project. They have been assisted by other ARCIC III members in the task of gathering these Statements together, placing them in their context, assessing their reception, and setting out where further work needs to be undertaken. This volume represents the outcome of that task.